

# CROSS-CULTURAL CONSUMER BEHAVIOR RESEARCH IN GLOBAL MARKETS: BRANDING LESSONS AND BEST PRACTICES

# Prof. A. SURYANARAYANA

Former Dean
Faculty of Management
Osmania University, HYDERABAD
(Telangana State)
professorsuryanarayana@gmail.com

#### Dr. VENKATA RAO BADIYA

Faculty Member (Assistant Director)
National Institute of Agricultural Extension
Management (MANAGE)
[An Autonomous Organization of
Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers

Address: Rajendranagar, Hyderabad-5000060, Telangana State, India bvrao@manage.gov.in

Welfare, Government of India]

# **ABSTRACT**

In an increasingly globalized marketplace, understanding cross-cultural consumer behavior is crucial for the success of global brands. This article synthesizes key findings from cross-cultural consumer behavior research to provide actionable insights for marketers. Drawing on foundational theories and contemporary studies, it tries to explore how cultural differences influence consumer attitudes, perceptions, and purchasing behaviors. It discusses the role of cultural dimensions in shaping consumer preferences. It also highlights best practices for global brands, including the importance of cultural adaptation, the use of culturally resonant marketing messages, and the integration of local consumer insights into global strategies. By examining successful case studies and identifying common pitfalls, this article offers practical guidelines for marketers aiming to navigate the complexities of cross-cultural consumer markets and build strong, culturally attuned brands. This conceptual article succinctly covers the scope, significance, and practical implications thereof of the overall theme under study.

**Keywords:** Consumer Behavior Research; Cultural Differences; Consumer Attitudes; Cross-cultural Communication; and Global Brands.

### Introduction

Consumer behavior research is the study of individuals, groups, and organizations and how they select, purchase, consume, and dispose of goods and services. Depending on the social and cultural context, consumer behavior can vary from place-to-place, rousing the need for cross-cultural consumer behavior research. Businesses aiming to expand and conquer new markets must be aware of cross cultural consumer behavior to mold their products and marketing endeavors according to their targeted segments. However, there can be a few obstacles to successfully navigating these territories. By understanding them, global brands can develop more effective marketing strategies and succeed in new markets. Every decision made by man is influenced by a plethora of factors. A consumer's mindset is no different.

# **Survey of Literature**

Understanding cross-cultural consumer behavior is pivotal for global brands aiming to effectively reach and resonate with diverse markets. The body of literature on this topic is extensive, spanning multiple disciplines including marketing, psychology, sociology, and anthropology. This survey examines and provides a comprehensive overview of the key literature in the field of cross-cultural consumer behavior research, highlighting foundational

Anveshana's International Journal Of Research In Education, Literature, Psychology And Library Sciences



(ISSN-2456-3897)ONLINE

# Anveshana's International Journal Of Research In Education, Literature, Psychology And **Library Sciences**

theories, methodological approaches, and practical applications. Some of the contributions in this regard are given below:

# 1. Foundational Theories and Models

- Geert Hofstede's cultural dimensions theory (1984) is a cornerstone in cross-cultural research, providing a framework for understanding how cultural differences impact consumer behavior. Hofstede identifies six dimensions: power distance, individualism vs. collectivism, masculinity vs. femininity, uncertainty avoidance, long-term orientation, and indulgence vs. restraint, which are widely used to compare cultural tendencies across countries.
- Another significant model is Schwartz's theory of basic human values (1992), which posits that cultural values influence consumer preferences and behaviors. Schwartz identifies ten universal values that guide human behavior, providing a robust framework for cross-cultural analysis.

# 2. Consumer Behavior and Cultural Contexts

- De Mooij (2019) emphasizes the necessity of understanding cultural contexts in consumer behavior, arguing that global marketing strategies must be adapted to local cultures to be effective. This is echoed by Usunier and Lee (2013), who advocate for marketing strategies that respect cultural differences rather than impose a standardized approach.
- Steenkamp (2001) discusses the role of national culture in shaping consumer behavior, suggesting that cultural differences can lead to varying interpretations and receptions of marketing messages. Luna and Gupta (2001) propose an integrative framework that combines psychological and cultural factors to explain cross-cultural consumer behavior, highlighting the complex interplay between individual and cultural influences.

# 3. Methodological Approaches

- Craig and Douglas (2006) argue for a dynamic approach to cultural research, suggesting that traditional static models may not fully capture the fluid nature of culture. They propose methods that account for cultural change and diversity within national boundaries.
- Shavitt, Lee, and Torelli (2009) examine cross-cultural issues in consumer behavior from a social psychology perspective, providing insights into how cultural norms and values influence consumer decision-making processes. Their work highlights the importance of understanding social context in cross-cultural research.

# 4. Case Studies and Practical Applications

Okazaki (2004) investigates the standardization vs. localization debate in international advertising, presenting case studies of multinational companies. His findings suggest that while some level of standardization is beneficial for brand coherence, localization is crucial for market relevance.



(ISSN-2456-3897)ONLINE

# Anveshana's International Journal Of Research In Education, Literature, Psychology And Library Sciences

• Aaker, Benet-Martínez, and Garolera (2001) explore how cultural symbols are used in branding, showing that cultural congruence enhances brand perception and loyalty. Their research underscores the importance of culturally resonant marketing strategies.

# 5. Emerging Trends and Future Directions

- Recent studies, such as those by Arnould and Thompson (2005), advocate for a consumer culture theory (CCT) approach, which considers the socio-cultural context of consumer behavior. This perspective emphasizes the role of cultural narratives and identity in shaping consumer choices.
- Technological advancements and digital globalization are also shaping cross-cultural consumer behavior. Research indicates that while digital platforms facilitate cultural exchange, they also highlight the persistence of cultural differences in online consumer behavior.

The survey of literature provided above reveals that understanding cross-cultural consumer behavior is essential for global brands aiming to build effective and culturally attuned marketing strategies. Theories and models from diverse disciplines provide a comprehensive framework for analyzing cultural influences on consumer behavior. Future research should continue to explore the dynamic nature of culture and its implications for global marketing practices.

# The Field of Consumer Behavior

In fact, since the 1940s, consumer behavior research as a field has been under constant study, in trying to understand the why, when, how, and what consumers purchase. The research—then used to develop products and their marketing strategies. However, with time, researchers have realized that the field is far more nuanced than it previously appeared to be. This is especially so with the arrival of "globalization". As the industrial revolution sparked an interest and enabled businesses to expand their reach to new markets and cultures, consumer behavior got harder to predict. In fact, it became evident that consumer behavior is not just influenced by the situation (meaning—why, when, how and what), but also the context (identity, attitudes, patterns, and social and mental processes) of purchasing decisions. Fast-forward to the contemporary era, rapid advancements in technology and communication have accelerated the pace, transforming our planet into a global market. This has made it essential for brands to understand the unique consumer behavior patterns in different countries and regions. Therefore, consumer behavior research can be defined as the study of how individuals, groups, and organizations select, purchase, consume, and dispose of goods and services to satisfy their needs and wants. Meanwhile, cross-cultural consumer behavior research helps businesses identify behavioral patterns that vary across regions, thereby helping them develop effective marketing strategies that resonate with their target audiences.

# The Impact of Culture on Consumer Behavior

In the new-age global market, burgeoning opportunities for international business expansion coincide with the complexity of diverse consumer preferences. Cultural variables, including values and norms, significantly influence consumer behavior. For instance, distinctions between



(ISSN-2456-3897)ONLINE

# Anveshana's International Journal Of Research In Education, Literature, Psychology And **Library Sciences**

collectivist and individualist cultures manifest in varied priorities. Collectivist cultures tend to place more emphasis on group harmony and social approval, while individualist cultures tend to emphasize personal independence and self-expression. Hofstede's cultural dimensions model provides a structured framework to understand these nuances, encompassing aspects like power dynamics and risk tolerance. These cultural disparities impact consumer choices, emphasizing the necessity for businesses to conduct thorough research. This is where cross-cultural consumer behavior research comes in.

# **Challenges in Cross-cultural Market Research in Global Markets**

Cross-cultural market research in global markets presents challenges such as language barriers, cultural biases, and differing consumer behaviors. Language barriers are a significant challenge in cross-cultural market research. When conducting research in different countries, it is crucial to understand and communicate effectively in the local language. However, language proficiency alone is not enough. The researcher must also understand the nuances, idioms, and colloquialisms of the language to ensure accurate interpretation of responses. Misinterpretation due to language differences can lead to inaccurate data, which can negatively impact the validity of the research. Cultural biases also pose a significant challenge. Every culture has its own set of values, beliefs, and norms that influence consumer behavior. These cultural factors can significantly impact the way people respond to surveys or interviews, and how they perceive and interact with products or services. For instance, a product that is popular in one culture may not be well-received in another due to cultural differences. Therefore, researchers must be aware of these cultural biases and take them into account when designing their research methodology and interpreting their findings.

Differing consumer behaviors across cultures is another challenge. Consumer behavior is influenced by a variety of factors, including cultural, social, personal, and psychological factors. These factors can vary greatly from one culture to another, leading to different consumer behaviors. For example, consumers in one culture may prefer to shop online, while consumers in another culture may prefer to shop in physical stores. Understanding these differences in consumer behavior is crucial for effective market research, but it can be challenging due to the complexity and variability of these factors. Lastly, legal and ethical considerations can also pose challenges in cross-cultural market research. Different countries have different laws and regulations regarding data collection and privacy, which researchers must comply with. Additionally, ethical considerations, such as respecting cultural norms and ensuring informed consent, are also crucial in cross-cultural research. Navigating these legal and ethical issues can be complex and challenging, but it is essential for conducting valid and ethical research.

# **Cross-cultural Consumer Behavior Research in Action**

First introduced by Christopher Earley and Soon Ang in their book "Cultural Intelligence: Living and Working in a World of Diversity," Cultural Intelligence (CQ) was argued to be an essential skill for businesses that want to succeed in the globalized economy. In 2005, the Harvard Business Review published an article titled "Cultural Intelligence: The Secret Weapon for Global

(ISSN-2456-3897)ONLINE

# Anveshana's International Journal Of Research In Education, Literature, Psychology And Library Sciences

Success," that even declared—CQ is more important than IQ or EQ for success in the global workplace. In essence, Cultural intelligence (CQ) is the ability to understand and adapt to different cultures. It is a complex skill that involves a number of different factors, including:

- *Knowledge of Different Cultures:* This includes knowledge of cultural values, norms, beliefs, customs, traditions, and language.
- *Empathy:* The ability to understand and empathize with people from different cultures.
- Self-awareness: The ability to understand and manage your own biases and assumptions.
- **Behavioral Flexibility**: The ability to adapt your behavior to different cultural contexts.

So, it is essential for global brands to possess this skill if they want to succeed in new markets. Brands with high CQ are able to develop marketing strategies that are tailored to the unique needs and preferences of consumers in different cultures. Businesses need to learn a little about cross-cultural consumer behavior from the following examples of how one of these brands successfully adapted and the other failed to adapt to different cultural settings: A short documentary by CNBC tapped into the fascinating phenomenon of the "oreo" cookies. In 2012, Kraft celebrated the 100th anniversary of its iconic Oreo biscuit in Shanghai, showcasing the brand's adaptability in the Chinese market.

The festivities included transforming the Oriental Pearl Tower into Oreo blue, adorning skyscrapers with neon Oreo ads, and lighting up the Huangpu River with fireworks. Despite its American origins, Oreo has become China's top-selling biscuit. Kraft's success in the Chinese market lies in its strategic alterations to suit local tastes. Chinese Oreos are less sweet, come in varied shapes like straws and wafers, and boast flavors such as green tea ice cream and mango-orange. Kraft's approach, termed "reverse innovation," involves developing flavors in China that later become global hits. The company's focus on understanding and appealing to Chinese consumers' preferences has been crucial in driving Oreo's success, emphasizing the need for detailed market insights.

# **Challenges in Cross-Cultural Consumer Behavior Research**

# • Cultural Misinterpretation and its Consequences

One of the biggest challenges in cross-cultural consumer behavior research is cultural misinterpretation. This can happen when researchers do not have a good understanding of the culture they are studying. For example, a researcher might use a survey question that is culturally insensitive or that has different meanings in different cultures. This can lead to inaccurate results and misleading conclusions.

# • Navigating Sensitivities and Taboos

Another challenge in cross-cultural consumer behavior research is navigating sensitivities and taboos. It is important for researchers to be respectful of the cultural values and beliefs of the people they are studying. This means avoiding topics that are considered sensitive or taboo in the culture.

# • Ethical Considerations in Cross-cultural Marketing



(ISSN-2456-3897)ONLINE

# Anveshana's International Journal Of Research In Education, Literature, Psychology And **Library Sciences**

There are also a number of ethical considerations to keep in mind when conducting cross-cultural consumer behavior research. For example, researchers should obtain informed consent from participants and protect their privacy. Researchers should also avoid exploiting or harming participants in any way.

# • Language Barriers

Language is a major barrier to cross-cultural research. Researchers need to be able to communicate effectively with participants in their native language, and they also need to be able to translate research materials accurately. Language can often be reliant on context, which may get lost in translation. This can lead to miscalculated results. In 2012, the American technology company Apple launched a new voice assistant called *Siri* in China.

However, Siri was unable to understand or respond to many Chinese words and phrases. This led to frustration and disappointment among Chinese users.

# • Access to Participants

It can be difficult to recruit participants for cross-cultural research, especially in remote or hardto-reach areas. Researchers may also need to obtain special permission to conduct research in certain countries or cultures.

#### • Time and Cost

Cross-cultural research can be expensive, especially if it involves conducting research in multiple countries. Researchers need to budget for travel, translation, and other costs. In addition to that it can also be time-consuming. This especially si if it involves building relationships with participants and developing a good understanding of the culture. Researchers need to be patient and willing to invest time in the research process.

# Tools and Approaches for Effective cross-cultural Research

Cross-cultural consumer behavior research can be challenging but not impossible. The first step is to understand who your consumers are and what influences their purchasing behavior. Here are a number of tools and approaches that researchers can use to improve their chances of success.

# • Market segmentation in Cross-cultural Context

One way to overcome the challenges of cross-cultural consumer behavior research is to use market segmentation. Market segmentation is the process of dividing a market into groups of consumers with similar needs and wants. This can be done based on a variety of factors, including demographics, psychographics, and cultural variables. By segmenting the market, researchers can develop more targeted and effective marketing strategies.

# • Surveys, focus groups, and observational research: Best practices

When conducting surveys, focus groups, or observational research in a cross-cultural context, it is important to take the following best practices into account:

a) Use culturally appropriate language and symbols. This includes avoiding any language or symbols that might be considered offensive or insensitive in the culture.



#### VOLUME 8, ISSUE 4 (2023, JUL/AUG)

(ISSN-2456-3897)ONLINE

# Anveshana's International Journal Of Research In Education, Literature, Psychology And **Library Sciences**

- b) Be aware of cultural differences in communication styles. For example, some cultures are more indirect in their communication style, while others are more direct.
- c) Use multiple data collection methods. This will help to reduce the risk of bias and ensure that you are getting a complete picture of consumer behavior.
- Utilizing Technology for Cross-cultural Consumer Insight

Technology can be a valuable tool for cross-cultural consumer behavior research. For example, researchers can use social media to collect data on consumer conversations and trends. They can also use online surveys and focus groups to reach consumers in different countries.

# **Strategies for Global Brands**

ALIRELPLS

One of the most important strategies for global brands is to adapt their products and services for different markets. This means taking into account the unique needs and preferences of consumers in different cultures. For example, a global clothing brand might offer different styles and sizes in different countries. It is also important for global brands to build a consistent brand identity across cultures. This means developing a brand that is recognizable and appealing to consumers in different countries. A global brand can achieve this by using consistent brand messaging, visuals, and values in all of its marketing materials. Global brands can also leverage local influencers and opinion leaders to reach consumers in different cultures. Influencers are people who have a large following on social media or in their communities.

Opinion leaders are people who are respected for their expertise in a particular field. Global brands can partner with influencers and opinion leaders to create and promote content that is relevant to consumers in different cultures.

#### Reasons for the Failure of Starbucks in Australia

Another CNBC feature, "Why Starbucks failed in Australia," highlights how despite its huge success in the Americas', its launch could be a misguided attempt, par the ignorance of varying consumer behavior in the context of different cultures. The company's ambitious expansion plans led to rapid openings, reaching 87 locations by 2008. However, this pace outpaced local demand and failed to allow Australian consumers to develop an appetite for the Starbucks brand. This resulted in \$105 million in losses and prompted closures post 2008's global financial crisis. The Australian coffee culture, influenced by Italian and Greek immigrants, places a high value on socialization at coffee shops and has distinctive drinks like the flat white. Starbucks' to-go focused cafes and menu, emphasizing sugary drinks, did not align with the social and taste preferences of the Australian market. Additionally, Starbucks faced stiff competition from local coffee shops which tailored its offerings to the Australian market with espresso and local specialty drinks. Starbucks struggled with cost competitiveness, as its drinks were often priced higher than those from trusted local baristas. The company's failure in Australia underscored the importance of strategic growth, understanding local cultures, and adapting business models to suit market nuances.

# **Future Trends in Cross-cultural Consumer Behavior Research**

• The Role of Technology in Bridging Cultural Gaps



(ISSN-2456-3897)ONLINE

# Anveshana's International Journal Of Research In Education, Literature, Psychology And Library Sciences

Technology is playing an increasingly important role in bridging cultural gaps. For example, social media and translation tools are making it easier for people from different cultures to connect and communicate. This is leading to a more globalized consumer market, where consumers are more exposed to products and brands from different countries.

# • Emerging Markets and their Unique Consumer Behavior Dynamics

Emerging markets are also playing a growing role in the global economy. These markets have unique consumer behavior dynamics that global brands need to understand. For example, consumers in emerging markets are often more price-sensitive and more likely to be influenced by word-of-mouth marketing.

# • Sustainability and Ethical Consumerism on a Global Scale

Sustainability and ethical consumerism are also becoming increasingly important on a global scale. Consumers are more interested in buying products from brands that are committed to sustainability and social responsibility. Global brands need to take these trends into account when developing their marketing strategies.

# **Cross-cultural Communication in Customer Support: Best Practices**

In the global marketplace, effective cross-cultural communication in customer support is not just an advantage; it's a necessity. As businesses expand their reach, the ability to engage customers from diverse cultural backgrounds becomes crucial. Integrating multilingual support and understanding cross-cultural nuances are key factors in enhancing customer experience, often achieved through the strategic move of outsourcing customer support.

# **Successful Cross-cultural Communication**

The cornerstone of successful cross-cultural communication lies in recognizing and respecting cultural differences. A study by Harvard Business Review highlights that customers generally feel more valued when their cultural context is understood and respected.

This understanding goes beyond language proficiency; it involves comprehending cultural expressions, traditions, and expectations. Outsourcing customer support can be a powerful tool in achieving this. By partnering with providers who specialize in multilingual and multicultural support, businesses can ensure that their customer service is not only linguistically accurate but also culturally sensitive. This approach enhances the customer experience, leading to higher satisfaction and loyalty. Some of the key best practices in cross-cultural communication include:

- Language Proficiency: Proficient multilingual support is fundamental. It's about fluency and the ability to convey tone, empathy, and understanding in the customer's native language.
- *Cultural Training:* For outsourced teams, regular training on cultural nuances and customer interaction styles is vital. This training helps in navigating cultural differences effectively.
- *Listening and Empathy:* Understanding customer needs in a multicultural context requires active listening and empathy. This approach builds trust and rapport with customers from various cultural backgrounds.



(ISSN-2456-3897)ONLINE

# Anveshana's International Journal Of Research In Education, Literature, Psychology And Library Sciences

• *Feedback and Adaptation:* Continuous feedback from customers and adapting support strategies accordingly is crucial for businesses. It ensures that the support provided remains relevant and respectful of cultural dynamics.

Therefore, cross-cultural consumer behavior research is essential for global brands that want to succeed in new markets. However, it is important to be aware of the challenges involved in cross-cultural research, such as cultural misinterpretation, ethical considerations, language barriers, etc. By understanding the challenges and trends in cross-cultural consumer behavior research, global brands can develop more effective marketing strategies and succeed in new markets. Businesses need to uncover the unique needs and preferences of consumers in different cultures and go global with outsourced comprehensive consumer research services. Mastering cross-cultural communication in customer support is an ongoing journey. Outsourcing this function offers businesses a path to excel in this area, providing access to skilled, multilingual, and culturally competent teams. This strategy not only enhances customer experience but also positions businesses strongly in the global market. In the global marketplace, effective crosscultural communication in customer support is not just an advantage; it's a necessity. As businesses expand their reach, the ability to engage customers from diverse cultural backgrounds becomes crucial. Integrating multilingual support and understanding cross-cultural nuances are key factors in enhancing customer experience, often achieved through the strategic move of outsourcing customer support.

# **Concluding Comments**

In an era of globalization, the ability of brands to understand and respond to cross-cultural consumer behavior is not just an advantage but a necessity. This article has explored the depth and breadth of research on this topic, drawing insights from seminal theories, empirical studies, and practical case analyses. One of the most significant takeaways is the importance of cultural sensitivity and adaptability. Brands that succeed globally do so by recognizing and respecting cultural differences, tailoring their marketing strategies to resonate with local values, beliefs, and behaviors. The theoretical frameworks provided by Hofstede, Schwartz, and others offer invaluable tools for dissecting and understanding these cultural nuances. Furthermore, the debate between standardization and localization in marketing strategies remains critical. While a consistent global brand image is important, the need for localization cannot be overstated.

Successful brands find a balance, ensuring that their core brand values are maintained while also adapting to the cultural specifics of each market. This approach not only enhances consumer engagement but also fosters brand loyalty across diverse cultural contexts. Technological advancements and the rise of digital platforms have added layers of complexity and opportunity to cross-cultural consumer behavior. Brands must leverage these tools to gather real-time cultural insights and engage with consumers in ways that are culturally relevant and meaningful. Finally, the journey towards mastering cross-cultural consumer behavior is ongoing and dynamic. Global brands must continually invest in cultural research, embrace flexibility in their marketing strategies, and remain attuned to the evolving cultural landscapes. By doing so,



(ISSN-2456-3897)ONLINE

# Anveshana's International Journal Of Research In Education, Literature, Psychology And Library Sciences

they can build stronger, more authentic connections with consumers worldwide, ultimately driving global success. The lessons and best practices outlined in this article provide a roadmap for navigating the complexities of cross-cultural consumer behavior, offering actionable insights for brands aiming to thrive in a multicultural world.

# References

- 1. Aaker, J., Benet-Martínez, V., & Garolera, J. (2001). Consumption symbols as carriers of culture: A study of Japanese and Spanish brand personality constructs. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 81(3), 492-508.
- Hofstede, G. (1984). Culture's Consequences: International Differences in Work-Related Values (Vol. 5). Sage.
- 3. de Mooij, M. (2019). Consumer Behavior and Culture: Consequences for Global Marketing and Advertising. SAGE Publications.
- 4. Shavitt, S., Lee, A. Y., & Torelli, C. J. (2009). Cross-cultural issues in consumer behavior. In M. Wänke (Ed.), Social Psychology of Consumer Behavior (pp. 227-250). New York: Psychology Press.
- 5. Steenkamp, J. B. E. M. (2001). The role of national culture in international marketing research. International Marketing Review, 18(1), 30-44.
- 6. Usunier, J. C., & Lee, J. A. (2013). Marketing Across Cultures. Pearson Education.
- 7. Luna, D., & Gupta, S. F. (2001). An integrative framework for cross-cultural consumer behavior. International Marketing Review, 18(1), 45-69.
- 8. Trompenaars, F., & Hampden-Turner, C. (2011). Riding the Waves of Culture: Understanding Diversity in Global Business. Nicholas Brealey Publishing.
- 9. Schwartz, S. H. (1992). Universals in the content and structure of values: Theoretical advances and empirical tests in 20 countries. Advances in Experimental Social Psychology, 25, 1-65.
- 10. Solomon, M. R., Russell-Bennett, R., & Previte, J. (2012). Consumer Behaviour: Buying, Having, Being. Pearson Australia.
- 11. Nisbett, R. E. (2003). The Geography of Thought: How Asians and Westerners Think Differently... and Why. Free Press.
- 12. Okazaki, S. (2004). Do multinationals standardize or localize? The cross-cultural dimensionality of product-based Web sites. Internet Research, 14(1), 81-94.
- 13. Taylor, C. R. (2002). What is wrong with international advertising research? Journal of Advertising Research, 42(6), 48-54.
- 14. Craig, C. S., & Douglas, S. P. (2006). Beyond national culture: Implications of cultural dynamics for consumer research. International Marketing Review, 23(3), 322-342.
- 15. Arnould, E. J., & Thompson, C. J. (2005). Consumer culture theory (CCT): Twenty years of research. Journal of Consumer Research, 31(4), 868-882.